ANNEX A: Terms of Reference and Scope of Services

Consultancy Service for Project Results Monitoring & Evaluation for the Third Regional Development Project (RDP3) – II Phase

Section 1.Background

The Government of Georgia with World Bank co-financing is implementing a US\$75 million Third Regional Development Project (RDP3), focusing on Samtskhe-Javakheti and Mtskheta-Mtianeti during the period of 2015-2022.

The Project Development Objective is to improve infrastructure services and institutional capacity to support increased contribution of tourism in the local economy of the Samtskhe-Javakheti and Mtskheta-Mtianeti regions.

The project aims at addressing challenges identified during the project preparation period and follows integrated approach to urban and tourism development.

Through its various components the project is expected to lead to improved urban and tourist infrastructure, enhanced cultural heritage assets and increased capacity for tourism-based local economic development in these two regions. The economic benefits linked to the above are multiple, such as improved urban infrastructure, including public spaces, streetscapes and municipal roads, improved urban livability and increased safety of movement for locals. At the same time, these investments are expected to make selected municipalities better places to visit and more attractive places to invest, promoting private investment and increasing income generating opportunities in the project area. Cultural heritage enhancements will lead to the preservation of global public goods, but are also expected to lead to increased willingness to visit/pay for tourist and increased property prices in neighboring areas.

The proposed investments are aligned with the regional development strategies, prepared with technical assistance from EU for Mtskheta-Mtianeti and by GiZ for Samtskhe-Javakheti.

The project consists of the following components:

Component 1: Infrastructure Investment (US\$53.25 million)

<u>Component 1.1: Urban Regeneration and Circuit Development (US\$46.00 million):</u> This component finances: urban regeneration of old towns and villages, including restoration of building facades and roofs, public spaces, museums, roads and water, and enhancement of cultural and natural heritage sites, including access and presentation.

Based on product development and marketing potential, infrastructure needs and employment levels, the Project focuses on sites along the circuit, connecting the selected

heritage, nature and ski sites. The proposed sites/subprojects discussed with the Government for financing under the Project supplements what the Government has already invested in. These can be grouped into two categories:

- Urban regeneration in three hub cities: Dusheti, Stepantsminda and Abastumani. The Project also builds on previous urban regeneration investments made by the Government, and small-scale investments in Mtskheta, Bakuriani, Borjomi and Akhaltsikhe.
- Improved site management and construction of tourism facility and access road in the following cultural heritage sites: Saphara Monastery, Saro Darbazi houses, Zarzma Monastery, Vardzia caves, Vanis Qvabebi Caves, Khertvisi Fortress, Jvari monastery, Mtskheta archaeological sites, Ananuri Fortress, Gergeti Trinity Church, and Dariali monastery.

<u>Component 1.2: Provision of Public Infrastructure to Attract Private Investments (US\$7.25 million):</u> To encourage private sector investments in the region, this component supports a selected number of private sector entities in Project areas that demonstrate interest and capacity to invest in tourism or agribusiness through investing in complementary public infrastructure that is necessary to ensure the viability of their investments (e.g., public facilities within vicinity of the investments, road/sidewalk, water/sanitation, communications, etc.). The investment proposals are subject to screening by MDF selection committee and there is appropriate conditions tied to that.

Component 2: Institutional Development (US\$6.60 million)

The component supports institutional capacity and performance of the Georgia National Tourism Administration (GNTA), National Agency for Culture Heritage Preservation of Georgia (NACHP), Georgian National Museum (GNM), Project Implementing Entity (Municipal Development Fund of Georgia, MDF), and other local and regional entities in order for them to carry out the following activities: setting up of destination management office in each region; marketing and promotion; preparation of sustainable site management plans for all of the Project's cultural heritage sites; training for skilled workforce development and capacity building; cultural heritage advisory service to the NACHP to improve their capacity on protection and management of the World Heritage property Historical Monuments of Mtskheta to help with its removal from the List of World Heritage in Danger; business start-up/expansion advisory service to tourism SMEs; performance monitoring & evaluation activities; preparation of feasibility studies of potential investment subprojects, design and construction supervision.

Regional Dimension

Samtskhe-Javakheti stretches over 6,413 sq.km with population of 208,000. The region includes six large municipalities and its administrative center is Akhaltsikhe. Main urban areas are Akhalkalaki, Akhaltsikhe, Borjomi, Vale, and Ninotsminda.

Samtskhe-Javakheti is home to several cultural heritage sites and nature attractions. The most significant sites are: Akhaltsikhe and Borjomi historical cities, Abastumani wellness resort town with its vernacular wooden architecture houses, and observatory, Vardzia Cave Town and Vanis Kvabebi, Akhaltsikhe Fortress Rabati, Romanov Palace in Likani, Sapara Monastery, Zarzma Monastery, Khertvisi fortress, Phoka monastery, and Atskuri temple ruins and fortress.

The main nature attractions are: Bakuriani ski resort town, Borjomi-Kharagauli National Park (member of PanPark program) and protected areas of Javakheti, with lakes, wetlands, world known bird-watching sites and other wildlife.

In 2013, 180,273 international tourists visited the region. According to data from the year of 2013, there are 199 accommodation units, including 55 percent family houses, 36 percent hotels, and 4 percent guest houses. The total number of beds is 7,726. A SWOT analysis concerning the tourism sector highlighted a number of strengths comprising increasing tourism trends; ski infrastructure in Bakuriani; Borjomi-Kharagauli National Park and its tourism trails; uniqueness of cultural heritage; varied landscape, flora, fauna, and folk craft traditions. However, a number of weaknesses prevent tourism from growing further, including lack of high standard hotels; weak tourism and municipal infrastructure; low level of tourism services and skills; inadequate condition of natural and cultural heritage sites and poor access; lack of high quality food services, souvenirs and craft shops in the regions; and poor marketing, promotion and destination management.

The overall contribution of Samtskhe-Javakheti to the GDP of the country is relatively small, an average of about 3 percent from 2006-2012. The total value added of the Samtskhe-Javakheti Region during the period 2008-2012 had a positive trend (with the exception of 2009). In 2011, the region's total value added was GEL665 million, with agriculture accounting for 32 percent (GEL213.7 million). According to the preliminary information, the growth of total value added in 2012 was 0.7 percent compared to the previous year, equal to GEL646. In 2011, the turnover of the enterprises in the region, by economic activities, totaled GEL367.2 million, which was 30 percent higher than the previous year.

Mtskheta-Mtianeti region has an extension of 6,785 sq.km and a population of 125,000. The region includes four large municipalities and its administrative center is Mtskheta. The main urban areas are Mtskheta and Dusheti. Mtskheta-Mtianeti Region is a major tourism destination with the UNESCO World Heritage Site of Mtskheta city and an exceptional portfolio of cultural heritage and natural products with a year round appeal for foreign and domestic visitors. The most significant sites are: Mtskheta, Dusheti and Stepantsminda

historical cities with their vernacular architectural style, Svetitskhoveli church, Jvari temple, Shiomghvime Monastery, Archaeological Sites of Bagineti-Armazi and Samtavro-Dzalisi; Zedazeni Church, Bodorna Church, Ananuri Fortress, Gergeti Trinity Church, Shatili and Mutso historic fortified cultural heritage villages, and Sno fortress. The main nature attractions are: Kazbegi National Park, Gudauri ski resort and Tbilisi National Park. In 2013, 715,155 international tourists visited the region. There are 107 accommodation units, including 57 percent family houses, 39 percent hotels, and 4 percent guest houses. The total number of beds is 3,213. From a tourism standpoint, the region offers a variety of products, with potential to offer high-quality tourism, through preserving and enhancing wildlife, ecosystems, and cultural heritage. Harnessing the tourism potential of this region might help provide job opportunities and therefore support rural population, balancing migrations to lower plains.

The overall contribution of Mtskheta-Mtianeti to the GDP of the country is relatively small, an average of about 5 percent from 2006-2012. The total value added of Mtskheta-Mtianeti during the period 2008-2012 had a positive trend, reaching the highest (GEL1.3 billion) in 2012. The largest share of total value added is comprised of: industry 23 percent; public administration 20 percent, agriculture and forestry 18 percent. The annual monthly income of households in Mtskheta-Mtianeti Region was GEL601 (US\$364), making this region one of the poorest in the country. The average monthly expenditures equal GEL562. In 2013, the production output of Mtskheta-Mtianeti surpassed the amount of GEL327.3 million. The poverty rate, measured using an absolute poverty line, was 5.8 percent in Samtskhe-Javakheti and 22.8 percent in Mtskheta-Mtianeti in 2012. In Samtskhe-Javakheti, the unemployment rate was at 5.8 percent in 2012, which is lower than the country's average (15 percent). In Mtskheta-Mtianeti, the unemployment rate is estimated to be 14.6 percent, a rate close to the national average in 2012.

Expected Project Results

The Project activities are expected to benefit the residents, tourists and enterprises in Samtskhe-Javakheti and Mtskheta-Mtianeti regions. They are expected to receive improved access to, and quality of, public infrastructure; increased volume of private sector investments in the region; and increased small and micro enterprises in renovated cultural heritage sites and cities. The Government will benefit from increased overall tourism spending and satisfaction, job creation, improved institutional capacity of selected agencies, and improved capacity to operate and maintain assets.

The key results expected from the Project are included in **Annex 1**.

Section 2. Objective of the assignment

The objective of this consultancy is to carry out a monitoring and evaluation activities for the Project. The assessment should provide information to assess project implementation and achievement of Project Development Objectives during implementation and at project closure. The assessment shall provide reliable and useful information, which would allow identifying project achievements and lessons learned.

This assignment is a continuation of the previous one, which was conducted between 2017 and 2019 by an international firm. During this period, the consultant delivered various reports, including M&E Periodic and Final Results Reports & Evaluation of the Project. The Client will make all above mentioned reports available to the selected Consultant. In order to ensure comparability, the consultant will be expected to study the previous reports and collect same data used by the previous consulting firm. Consultant can propose a new methodology (additional useful data can be collected in household, business, tourism surveys and etc) and agree on the way forward with the Client. Based on the agreed work plan, the consultant will continue data collection and will produce deliverables as specified in the deliverables section below.

In order to do this, the consultancy firm should:

- (i) Conduct periodic data collection from primary and secondary sources to assess progress in the frequency outlined in the project results matrix. Validate (at least the core part of the methodology should be kept the same to ensure comparability of results between phase 1 and 2 of the M&E contract) and/or propose a methodology to conduct an expanded result assessment (which will collect primary data on key expected project results, as well as key socio-economic indicators of project beneficiaries). The expanded results assessment should consist at least of 3 surveys covering: tourists visiting the beneficiary region, households from beneficiary towns and tourism related firms in the region. Quantitative data collection (3 surveys) should also be complemented by Qualitative study through the focus group discussions and/or in-depth interviews prior to project closure. Consultant is encouraged to propose additional surveys and studies to collect information for the results matrix as necessary and develop storylines about each indicator;
- (ii) The consultant should monitor closely and inform if reaching target values are becoming unrealistic due to reduced speed of works implementation or decrease in tourist numbers due to COVID 19. The consultant should highlight this early to Client and Bank team, reflect on this with each report being delivered, and, if necessary, propose to revise target values of the results framework.

(iii) Evaluate project results based on collected data and develop storylines around each project indicator. Consultant should also make reference to the previous results of previous studies when evaluating project results and developing storylines;

Frequency of data collection: The consultant should collect data from secondary sources on a yearly basis throughout 3 years, and for primary sources: (i) two times (in 2020 and in 2022) in the case of the household and firm-level surveys to establish baseline and results prior to project closure, and (ii) 2 times per year in tourist peak season, throughout 3 years prior to completion of the project in the case of the tourist survey to establish a trend of visits to selected touristic sites.

Section 3. Scope of Work

Within this assignment, the Consultant will perform the following activities:

Task 1: Reviewing the project relevant documents (1)

Consultant is responsible for the review of all previous reports and proposal of the work plan, which will supplement the previous data collection tools and reporting to ensure consistency across two consultancies. As well as to build a story-line that would allow identifying direct and indirect impacts resulting from the RDPIII project. Consultant should also propose methodology to collect data to reflect and identify the COVID 19 impact.

- **1.1. Assess project progress and evaluation.** The consultant should review the project result matrix (Core methodology from previous Consultancy should be kept the same to ensure comparability) to monitor project progress in the frequency suggested by the results matrix. Consultant is encouraged to propose additional surveys and studies to collect information for results matrix and develop storylines about each indicator.
- 1.2. Review secondary data sources. As part of this the consultant should do a review all available secondary data relevant to the project from the various Government and non-government stakeholders included but not limited to the national statistics, GNTA, MDF, chambers of commerce. Private sector investments data (linked to indicator 1) recorded by local governments or chambers of commerce are considered as secondary data. In order to fully inform the status of some of the PDO indicators, the firm is free to propose collection of additional data using secondary information sources such as from GNTA and regional tourism statistics, tourism information centers or equivalents in respected municipalities, etc.
- **1.3. Identify indicators to be collected using primary sources.** The consultant should then proceed to outline the methodology (Core methodology from previous Consultancy should be kept the same to ensure comparability) for the development of data collection

from primary sources. At a minimum the consultant is expected to collect primary data from three different sources: (i) tourists, (ii) household and (iii) tourism-related business. It is expected that through the secondary and primary sources the consultant is able to provide a full assessment of project progress, and results – prior to closure. Below is a detailed description of the three primary data sources and what should be included as part of the Inception Report.

1.4. Results Assessment Inception Report. As part of task 1 the consultant should produce an inception report which clearly outlines the methodology to be used and any additions which are proposed to the existing approach.

Task 2: Developing a methodology to collect project results matrix data (2)

Based on the agreed methodology under Task 1 (provided in inception report) the consultant shall collect data in the frequency and using the methodology as outlined in the inception report. For the purpose of primary data collection from households, tourists and tourism-based firms the consultant should:

- 2.1. Define sampling and surveying techniques for each of the surveys including quality control mechanisms to ensure comparability with results of the baseline surveys. The consultant will confirm, using statistics methods (Power calculations), the size of the sample that will be covered for households and business (Registered and non-registered) to assure they are representative at the city level, and propose a methodology for doing counts and sampling tourists. The sampling methodology and sample proposal will be presented to the Employer for approval as part of the inception report.
- **2.2. Adapt example survey instruments to local context.** The Consultant will be responsible of reviewing and adapting survey instruments to the local context. The Consultant will format, pre-code, and print the instrument (if paper based) or will be responsible of doing the digital conversion for CAPI. Any changes to the field version of the instrument must be approved by the Employer. The Consultant will pre-test the instruments in Georgian, Russian and English for the case of the tourist survey. The adjusted instruments will be included in the inception report for Employer's approval.
- 2.3. Provide training to supervisors and interviewers. The Consultant will train interviewers, supervisors and data entry operators to make sure that they understand and are capable to carry out the activities outlined in these Terms of Reference. Training will take place after the instrument has been adjusted. Interviewers and supervisors must assist to all training sessions in order to be able to start data collection. The Consultant will identify a quality control process, including multiple filters, to be used during data collection to assure quality. Quality control report should be the part of the reporting.
- **2.4. Methodological chapter to the inception report.** Results of Task 2 should be included in the inception report. The Inception report should also include a description of the

methodology to be used for listing/sampling/data collection of each of the surveys, as well as proposed survey instruments for all surveys. Finally the Inception Report should include a data collection calendar that allows for counting seasonality. The consultant can only proceed to Task 3 upon the written approval of the employer.

Below is a description of the three primary data collection exercises that should be covered by the consultant;

- <u>Tourism Related Surveys.</u> A survey of tourists in the selected locations is expected to be carried out by means of face-to-face interviews, and recording GPS location. Below are some specific details of the survey that should be taking into consideration by the consultant:
 - This survey should be to assure that it captures well the tourism peak (The survey periods must be adjusted to proposed destinations and based on Regional Tourism related statistics).
 - The consultant should highlight in the storyline that for some tourist counts decreased numbers are due to COVID and to monitor the trend very closely to inform MDF and the Bank team if end targets are likely not being achieved until project closing.
 - Additional questions in relation to Covid 19 must be included, which will be useful for better understanding what effect external factors (in this case Covid 19) had on the project results.
 - The random selection procedure for the selection of tourists should be specified as part of the inception report. The interviews should be distributed: (i) in different days of the week; (ii) in different times during the day.
 - The Consultant should setup a protocol to count visits during each of the days. For the selection of the *nth tourist for the tourist study (every 3rd or 4th for example) that comes to the site. Tourism counts should be part of the deliverable as they will be used to assess increased number of visitors (PDO indicator 3).
 - The Consultant is expected to collect the socio-demographic background characteristics of the participants (international and domestic visitors). The latter must include: age group, country of origin, gender, family members, ethnicity, education attainment level, occupation and other indicators. Survey should last no more than 10-15 minutes and should also yield quantitative data among others on: Information and Booking process, Length of visit, place of stay and means of transportation, Sites/places visited during stay, Itemized amount spent during visit, Expectation and satisfaction with a set of attributes, including tourist sites, accommodation, food, accessibility, transportation in and transportation within, urban infrastructure, expensiveness, cultural heritage, etc.

- The survey instrument should be available in multiple languages to be able to correctly capture tourists from different origins. It is the responsibility of the consultant to translate the instrument to the different languages.
- The survey will be carried out by means of face-to-face interviews which each selected tourist. The survey instrument should be conducted in Georgian, Russian or English. Each of the interviewers should have a device capable of recording GPS coordinates. In addition, the quality control mechanisms should be put in place to assess whether interviewers are correctly carrying out the tourist survey and put in place repairing measures to review and correct any mistakes.
- At least 130 valid responses from each site should be collected. There should be a minimum of 8 sites where head counts should be conducted. The sites should include but not be limited to: Bakuriani Resort, Stepantsminda, Abastumani, Mtskheta, Vardzia Caves, and Rabati Castle.
- Household Related Surveys. A household survey is expected to be carried out by means
 of face-to-face interviews. Below are some specific details of the survey that should be
 taking into consideration by the consultant:
 - A listing exercise should be carried out in at least 5 locations (including but not limited to Abastumani, Dusheti and Mtskheta), gathering the observed population totals in each selected cluster for the purpose of weight adjustments.
 - The total sample size should be representative at the level of each urban centre, with between 150-200 households for each urban centre. In order to conduct statistically robust analyses levels of precision should be at a minimum of 7.5% for 90% confidence intervals for estimates of population proportions (percentages)/prevalence of all variables asked as proportions (percentages).
 - Unique enumerator identifiers should be used throughout data collection, and included in the final data provided to the Project. The survey will be administered to a randomly selected member of the household, to ensure that both men and women are represented. The Instrument needs to collect the required baseline data as well as the socio-demographic background characteristics of the participants. The latter must include: age group, gender, ethnicity, education attainment level, employment situation, occupation, place of residence and other indicators that will be provided to the Consultant. Additions to the survey instruments (instruments) will be provided to the Consultant by the project.
 - o The interview should last no more than 30 minutes.
 - The baseline study should yield quantitative and qualitative data among others
 on: (1) Access to public services/infrastructure/public spaces related to the

- project (whether households knew that the RDP3 project rehabilitated infrastructure in their municipality), (2) Satisfaction public services/infrastructure/public spaces related to the project, (3) Housing characteristics, value and use (e.g. rental, etc) AND (4) Labor market outcomes, particularly employment linked to the tourism sector, including in-house activities.
- The Consultant will proceed to carry out the household survey based on the successful completion of actions and conditions outlined and approved by the Employer as part of the Inception Report. The review of the survey instruments shall be made before piloting, especially for the testing of the questions for the identification of the poor. The Survey will be carried out by means of face-to-face interviews with each selected household from the sample. The interview should be conducted with either a randomly selected adult in the household. Interviews should not be conducted with people under the age of 18, or with household members who are insufficiently informed about household affairs to complete the instrument.
- Each of the interviewers should have a device capable of recording GPS coordinates. In addition, the quality control mechanisms should be put in place to assess whether interviewers are correctly carrying out the household survey and put in place repairing measures to review and correct any mistakes.
- Tourism-related Business Surveys. A business survey is expected to be carried out by means of face-to-face interviews and recording GPS coordinates. The survey should aim at complementing secondary information collected, by providing additional information on private sector investments in targeted areas and number of jobs created (both PDO indicators). The firm should aim at identifying direct project results (those linked in particular to component 3 activities) and indirect project results. The firm should assess COVID 19 impact on Businesses surveyed.
 - For this purpose the consulting firm should: (i) conduct <u>surveys on all beneficiary</u> <u>firms under component 3</u> (direct private sector investments leveraged by the project) and, (ii) conduct survey on a sample of tourism firms that did not benefit from Component 3.
 - o For non-component 3 firms: The total sample size should be representative of informal and formal tourism-related businesses at the level of each of the selected urban centres. It should consider business count on the number of (formal and informal) businesses operating in the project municipalities and how many businesses did expand their activities in the beginning of the contract and at the end of the project. Tourism-related businesses are those involved with providing goods and/or services directly to tourists and possibly to firms

serving tourists (e.g. hotels, their suppliers, other accommodations, tour operators, travel agencies, restaurants and bars/cafes, taxi and transport providers, art and handicraft craft retail, other retail outlets used by tourists). If a firm list does not exist the consultant will need to develop a sample frame which covers both informal and formal tourist-related business in the region. The methodology to construct the sample frame should also be included as part of Task 2 and the list produced be provided as part of deliverables under task 3. The sample of firms will be randomly chosen, with probability proportional to the number of employees in the firm, from the list of all tourism-related enterprises/ firms named as workplaces by individuals in the household survey. These list of firms will contain information on the name, address or approximate location, phone number, size, and activity (industry or sector) of the firm. The sample size will be confirmed during the inception report and based on those operating as formally registered entities within the target municipalities. There will be reserve firms on a separate list. The number of reserves will be 100% of the number of enterprises/firms on the original list.

The Survey should yield quantitative data on: Access to (services/infrastructure of the project), Satisfaction with (which services/infrastructure of the project), Firm growth, Local Business environment, Assessment whether the RDP3 investments where the reason for Businesses to start up a new business activity or expand their business, COVID 19 impact on Business investments (did Businesses only invest a smaller amount of money due to COVID-related financial difficulties or whether they had delayed their planned investments etc). The survey instruments should be included as part of the inception report.

Focus group discussions. The firm should also conduct targeted focus group surveys for preidentified businesses which have directly and indirectly (positive externalities of improved infrastructure, services, tourism capacity) benefited from the project. This should be done at a minimum once in 2020 and in 2022 prior to project closure (considering the target locations (sites) specifics). The survey should inquire how (if at all) project improved infrastructure and services have influenced business investment and growth. For better understanding, the write-up of the discussions should be detailed.

Task 3. Test and overseeing data collection for M&E

Based on the agreed methodology under Task 1 and Task 2 the consultant should proceed to:

3.1. Test proposed survey instruments and propose changes. This activity should include a pilot test of the approved survey instruments and then be adjusted to create an optimal methodology and data collection instruments, as applicable. The consultant should inform the employer of any changes proposed for the survey instruments. Once final approval of

instruments is obtained the consultant should proceed to carry out primary data collection in the frequency and following the calendar approved under Task 1 and Task 2.

- **3.2. Carry out secondary and primary data collection.** The consultant should proceed to carry out secondary and primary data collection in the frequency and using the methodology as outlined under Task 1 and Task 2 with updates approved under Task 3.1. The consultant should at a minimum produce the following outputs as part of this task:
 - Updated project results matrix for both PDO and Intermediate indicators and short summary report explaining methodology behind data, including data sources and COVID 19 impact on results values (if results value are likely not to be reached until project closing, consultant should highlight as soon as possible to MDF and Bank team).
 - Databases and summary report on findings for households and firm-level surveys (this should be done at a minimum once in 2020 and in 2022 prior to project closure)
 - Databases and summary report on findings for tourist survey and counting (this should be done at a minimum twice per year prior to completion of the project.
 - Focus group discussion summary report (this should be done at a minimum once in 2020 and in 2022 prior to project closure considering the target locations specifics)

Task 4. Project result assessment

The Consultant will produce periodic reports as described in Task 3. A final Results Report compiling all previous periodic results reports will be produced at the end of the assignment, which will summarize the project results assessment and findings from both secondary and primary data collection.

All reports, as applicable, should describe the data collection exercise including, i) a description of the method of data collection, ii) details regarding the sample frame (tourist counting) and sampling design, iii) details regarding the implementation, especially highlighting replacement and non-response rates, iv) any other sampling biases introduced in the survey implementation, v) all codes used relating to the survey, and vii) any other pertinent information for data analysis. The report will also cover observations/experiences arising from the survey including survey design, observations of the pilot, survey implementation, and data quality.

The Final report will serve as overarching document, which will provide with no limitation to the following:

- The summary of the information provided in the previous reports
- Reference to the results of the previous M&E consultancy for showing the data in perspective of the whole project timeframe
- Succinct summary of the methodology used
- Observations from the test and oversight data collection
- All intermediate and final results of the project

- Best practices observed
- Lessons learned
- Recommendations for the similar assignment in the future
- Information on COVID 19 impact

Apart from the periodic reports followed by the data collection, consultant is to deliver quarterly progress reports to describe the ongoing activities, any potential issues with reaching target values at project closing, related to COVID-19 (or other unforeseen circumstances) and updated data for Annex 1: Results Framework and Monitoring.

Section 4. Qualifications and Level of Effort

The Consultant (firm) should possess the following minimum qualifications:

- No less than 3 (three) years of experience in monitoring and evaluation activities is required.
- At least one similar contract successfully carried out within the last 5 years with certificates of satisfaction (signed handover agreement) issued by the Client(s).
- Key staff with necessary qualifications and experience to run and manage the assigned project. These include:
- Team Leader, who plans, supervises and manages the surveys with the assistance of the field and data managers. S/he is responsible for the reporting to the Client. Requirements comprise more than ten years of experience in managing and conducting related development surveys, evaluations, and field research, including significant experience conducting large-scale, complex, mixed-method studies, and producing high quality written deliverables; degree in management, or other relevant field, and specific training in survey management.
- Field Manager, responsible for training of field staff, who plans, supervises and manages the field work. The Field Manager must have experience in managing field work; have degree in management, or other relevant field, and specific training in survey management.
- Data Manager who plans, supervises and manages data entry, error checking, processing and consolidation of data; has solid skills in both quantitative and qualitative analysis including professional and frequent application of quantitative analysis software such as SPSS, STATA, or equivalent applications. The data manager must have experience in managing data entry for surveys; degree in statistics or other relevant discipline; specific training in data entry for household survey management.
- Most of the team members must have excellent written and oral communication skills in Georgian. All interviewers must speak both Georgian and English to be able to conduct interviews in a language applicable to the selected beneficiaries.

Section 5. Language

The working language of the report is English and Georgian. All reports should be submitted in two hard copies, electronically and CDs in both languages.

Section 6. Duration

The assignment is expected to start in September 2020 and be completed by December 1, 2022.

Section 7. Deliverables Schedule

Payment	%	Deliverable	Timeline
1	30%	Deliverable 1: Inception Report (including results of Task 1 and Task	within a month after
		2)	the contract is signed
2	10%	Deliverable 2: Task 3 - Test and overseeing data collection for M&E (Periodic Results Report) – Households and firm-level surveys	December 2020
3	15%	Deliverable 3: Task 3 - Test and overseeing data collection for M&E (Periodic Results Report) - Tourist survey and counting	September 2021
4	15%	Deliverable 4: Task 3 - Test and overseeing data collection for M&E (Periodic Results Report) - Households and firm-level surveys and Tourist survey and counting	September 2022
5	30%	Deliverable 5: Task 4 – Project result assessment	December, 2022

Each report will be reviewed by the Client and the World Bank. The revision will take up to four weeks, which will not count against the Consultant's timeframe. All deliverables will be paid upon successful approval by the Client and The donor (WB). The Consultant cannot proceed to the next Task without the acceptance of the previous deliverable by the Client.

Annex 1: Results Framework and Monitoring:

Project Development Objectives

The Project Development Objective is to improve infrastructure services and institutional capacity to support increased contribution of tourism in the local economy of the Samtskhe-Javakheti and Mtskheta-Mtianeti regions.

2 Increased annual number of visitors at Project sites (percentage) 3 Number of jobs created by activities linked to support tourism industry (gender disaggregated) (Number) 4 New or rehabilitated urban public spaces in selected municipalities (Square Meter(nz)) 5 Increased volume of private sector investments in targeted areas. (USD) mln 6 Number of people in urban areas provided with access to all-season roads within a 500meter range under the project (Number) 7 Increased number of hours per day of piped water services in project areas (hour) 8 18 Consultancy Firr Intermediate Results Indicators 8 Direct project beneficiaries (Number) 9 Female beneficiaries (Percentage, Supplement) 10 Grievances registered related to delivery of project benefits addressed (Percentage) 11 (Percentage) 12 Number of museums refurbished (Number) 13 Number of tourism facilities constructed at cultural heritage sites along the tourist circuit (Number) 14 Piped household water connections that are benefiting from rehabilitation works undertaken by the project (Number) 15 Improved access roads to selected tourism attraction sites (Kilometers) 16 Number of houses restored (Number) 17 Number of bnuses restored (Number) 18 Consultancy Firr Number of project (Number) 19 Production and distribution of new maps based on geo-tourism database (Number) 20 Quoto Consultancy Firr Number of Parks upgraded (Number) 21 Number of Parks upgraded (Number) 22 (Number of beneficiaries of skills development training provided by the Project, disaggregated by gender (Number) 22 (Increased number of tourism related enterprises (e.g., souvenir and handcraft disaggregated by gender (Number) 24 (Consultancy Firr Percentage) 25 (Increased number of tourism related enterprises (e.g., souvenir and handcraft shops, family and guest houses, restaurants, museums, etc.). (Number)	N	Indicator description	Baseline	End Target	Data Collection				
2 Increased annual number of visitors at Project sites (percentage) 3 Number of jobs created by activities linked to support tourism industry (gender disaggregated) (Number) 4 New or rehabilitated urban public spaces in selected municipalities (Square Meter(m2)) 5 Increased volume of private sector investments in targeted areas. (USD) min 6 Number of people in urban areas provided with access to all-season roads within a 500meter range under the project (Number) 7 Increased number of hours per day of piped water services in project areas (hour) 8 18 Consultancy Firr Increased number of hours per day of piped water services in project areas (hour) 8 Direct project beneficiaries (Number) 9 Female beneficiaries (Number) 10 Grievances registered related to delivery of project benefits addressed (Percentage) 11 Grievances responded to and/or resolved within one month of being filed (Percentage) 12 Number of museums refurbished (Number) 13 Number of tourism facilities constructed at cultural heritage sites along the tourist circuit (Number) 14 Undertaken by the project (Number) 15 Improved access roads to selected tourism attraction sites (Kilometers) 16 Number of houses restored (Number) 17 Number of houses restored (Number) 18 Number of project (Number) 19 Piped household water connections that are benefiting from rehabilitation works undertaken by the project (Number) 10 Grievances restored (Number) 11 Improved access roads to selected tourism attraction sites (Kilometers) 11 Number of houses restored (Number) 12 Number of bruses restored (Number) 13 Number of bruses restored (Number) 14 Number of bruses posts and bulbs replaced (Number) 15 Improved access roads to selected tourism attraction sites (Kilometers) 16 Number of Parks upgraded (Number) 17 Number of Parks upgraded (Number) 18 Number of Parks upgraded (Number) 19 Production and distribution of new maps based on geo-tourism database (Number) 20 Consultancy Firr (Percentage) 21 Number of beneficiaries of skills development training provided by the Project,	PDO Indicators								
Number of jobs created by activities linked to support tourism industry (gender disaggregated) (Number) New or rehabilitated urban public spaces in selected municipalities (Square Meter(m2)) Increased volume of private sector investments in targeted areas. (USD) mln Number of people in urban areas provided with access to all-season roads within a SOOmeter range under the project (Number) Increased number of hours per day of piped water services in project areas (hour) Increased number of hours per day of piped water services in project areas (hour) Intermediate Results Indicators Birect project beneficiaries (Number) O 120 000 Consultancy Firm of Grievances registered related to delivery of project benefits addressed (Percentage) Number of museums refurbished (Number) Number of museums refurbished (Number) Number of fourism facilities constructed at cultural heritage sites along the tourist circuit (Number) Number of household water connections that are benefiting from rehabilitation works undertaken by the project (Number) Number of houses restored (Number) Number of houses restored (Number) Number of houses restored (Number) Number of street lighting posts and bulbs replaced (Number) Number of Parks upgraded (Number) Number of Parks upgraded (Number) Number of Parks upgraded (Number) Number of bouseholds in Project areas with home-based economic activities Percentage of households in Project areas with home-based economic activities Number of beneficiaries of skills development training provided by the Project, disaggregated by gender (Number) Number of beneficiaries of skills development training provided by the Project, disaggregated by gender (Number) Number of beneficiaries of skills development training provided by the Project, disaggregated by gender (Number) Number of beneficiaries of skills development training provided by the Project, disaggregated by gender (Number)	1	Number of functioning destination organizations in the project area. (Number)	0	2	Consultancy Firm				
disaggregated) (Number) disaggregated by gender (Number)	2	Increased annual number of visitors at Project sites (percentage)	0	25	Consultancy Firm				
Meter(m2)) Meter(m2)) Meter(m2)) Meter(m2)) Meter(m2)) Meter(m2)) Meter(m2)) Meter(m2)) Meter(m2)) Meter of people in urban areas provided with access to all-season roads within a 500 meter range under the project (Number) Meter of people in urban areas provided with access to all-season roads within a 500 meter range under the project (Number) Meter of local season roads within a 740 000 Meter range under the project (Number) Meter of local season roads within a 740 000 Meter range under the project (Number) Meter of local season roads within a 740 000 Meter areas of local season roads within a 740 000 Meter areas of local season roads within a 740 000 Meter areas of local season roads within a 740 000 Meter areas of local season roads within a 740 000 Meter areas of local season roads within of local season roads within of 60 000 Meter areas of local season roads wit	3	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	63 787	81 410	Consultancy Firm				
Number of people in urban areas provided with access to all-season roads within a 500meter range under the project (Number) Increased number of hours per day of piped water services in project areas (hour) Number of project beneficiaries (Number) Female beneficiaries (Percentage, Supplement) Grievances registered related to delivery of project benefits addressed (Percentage) Number of tourism facilities constructed at cultural heritage sites along the tourist circuit (Number) Number of tourism facilities constructed at cultural heritage sites along the tourist undertaken by the project (Number) Number of houses restored (Number) Number of beneficiaries of skills development training provided by the Project, disaggregated by gender (Number) Number of beneficiaries of skills development training provided by the Project, disaggregated by gender (Number) Increased number of tourism related enterprises (e.g., souvenir and handcraft shops, family and guest houses, restaurants, museums, etc.). (Number)	4			277 877	Consultancy Firm				
Someter range under the project (Number) Someter range under the project (Number) Increased number of hours per day of piped water services in project areas (hour) Sometime Some	5	Increased volume of private sector investments in targeted areas. (USD) mln	0	30	Consultancy Firm				
Solution	6		740 000	1280	Consultancy Firm				
B Direct project beneficiaries (Number) 9 Female beneficiaries (Percentage, Supplement) 10 Grievances registered related to delivery of project benefits addressed (Percentage) 11 Grievances responded to and/or resolved within one month of being filed (Percentage) 12 Number of museums refurbished (Number) 13 Number of tourism facilities constructed at cultural heritage sites along the tourist circuit (Number) 14 Piped household water connections that are benefiting from rehabilitation works undertaken by the project (Number) 15 Improved access roads to selected tourism attraction sites (Kilometers) 16 Number of houses restored (Number) 17 Number of street lighting posts and bulbs replaced (Number) 18 Number of Parks upgraded (Number) 19 Production and distribution of new maps based on geo-tourism database (Number) 20 Percentage of households in Project areas with home-based economic activities (Percentage) 21 Number of beneficiaries of skills development training provided by the Project, disaggregated by gender (Number) 22 Increased number of tourism related enterprises (e.g., souvenir and handcraft shops, family and guest houses, restaurants, museums,etc.). (Number) 20 Consultancy Firr (Consultancy Fir	7	Increased number of hours per day of piped water services in project areas (hour)	8	18	Consultancy Firm				
9 Female beneficiaries (Percentage, Supplement) 10 Grievances registered related to delivery of project benefits addressed (Percentage) 11 Grievances responded to and/or resolved within one month of being filed (Percentage) 12 Number of museums refurbished (Number) 13 Number of museums refurbished (Number) 14 Piped household water connections that are benefiting from rehabilitation works undertaken by the project (Number) 15 Improved access roads to selected tourism attraction sites (Kilometers) 16 Number of houses restored (Number) 17 Number of street lighting posts and bulbs replaced (Number) 18 Number of Parks upgraded (Number) 19 Production and distribution of new maps based on geo-tourism database (Number) 20 Percentage of households in Project areas with home-based economic activities (Percentage) 21 Number of beneficiaries of skills development training provided by the Project, disaggregated by gender (Number) 22 Increased number of tourism related enterprises (e.g., souvenir and handcraft shops, family and guest houses, restaurants, museums, etc.). (Number) 20 Consultancy Firm (Consultancy Firm (Consult	Intermediate Results Indicators								
Grievances registered related to delivery of project benefits addressed (Percentage) Grievances responded to and/or resolved within one month of being filed (Percentage) Number of museums refurbished (Number) Number of tourism facilities constructed at cultural heritage sites along the tourist circuit (Number) Piped household water connections that are benefiting from rehabilitation works undertaken by the project (Number) Improved access roads to selected tourism attraction sites (Kilometers) Number of houses restored (Number) Number of street lighting posts and bulbs replaced (Number) Number of Parks upgraded (Number) Production and distribution of new maps based on geo-tourism database (Number) Number of beneficiaries of skills development training provided by the Project, disaggregated by gender (Number) Increased number of tourism related enterprises (e.g., souvenir and handcraft shops, family and guest houses, restaurants, museums, etc.). (Number)	8	Direct project beneficiaries (Number)	0	120 000	Consultancy Firm				
Grievances responded to and/or resolved within one month of being filed (Percentage) Number of museums refurbished (Number) Number of tourism facilities constructed at cultural heritage sites along the tourist circuit (Number) Piped household water connections that are benefiting from rehabilitation works undertaken by the project (Number) Improved access roads to selected tourism attraction sites (Kilometers) Number of houses restored (Number) Number of street lighting posts and bulbs replaced (Number) Number of Parks upgraded (Number) Percentage of households in Project areas with home-based economic activities (Percentage) Number of beneficiaries of skills development training provided by the Project, disaggregated by gender (Number) Increased number of tourism related enterprises (e.g., souvenir and handcraft shops, family and guest houses, restaurants, museums, etc.). (Number)	9	Female beneficiaries (Percentage, Supplement)	0	60 000	Consultancy Firm				
(Percentage) Number of museums refurbished (Number) Number of tourism facilities constructed at cultural heritage sites along the tourist circuit (Number) Piped household water connections that are benefiting from rehabilitation works undertaken by the project (Number) Improved access roads to selected tourism attraction sites (Kilometers) Number of houses restored (Number) Number of houses restored (Number) Number of street lighting posts and bulbs replaced (Number) Number of Parks upgraded (Number) Production and distribution of new maps based on geo-tourism database (Number) Percentage of households in Project areas with home-based economic activities (Percentage) Number of beneficiaries of skills development training provided by the Project, disaggregated by gender (Number) Increased number of tourism related enterprises (e.g., souvenir and handcraft shops, family and guest houses, restaurants, museums, etc.). (Number)	10	Grievances registered related to delivery of project benefits addressed (Percentage)	0	100	Consultancy Firm				
Number of tourism facilities constructed at cultural heritage sites along the tourist circuit (Number) Piped household water connections that are benefiting from rehabilitation works undertaken by the project (Number) Improved access roads to selected tourism attraction sites (Kilometers) Number of houses restored (Number) Number of street lighting posts and bulbs replaced (Number) Number of Parks upgraded (Number) Production and distribution of new maps based on geo-tourism database (Number) Percentage of households in Project areas with home-based economic activities (Percentage) Number of beneficiaries of skills development training provided by the Project, disaggregated by gender (Number) Increased number of tourism related enterprises (e.g., souvenir and handcraft shops, family and guest houses, restaurants, museums, etc.). (Number)	11	·	0	100	Consultancy Firm				
circuit (Number) Piped household water connections that are benefiting from rehabilitation works undertaken by the project (Number) Improved access roads to selected tourism attraction sites (Kilometers) Number of houses restored (Number) Number of street lighting posts and bulbs replaced (Number) Number of Parks upgraded (Number) Production and distribution of new maps based on geo-tourism database (Number) Percentage of households in Project areas with home-based economic activities (Percentage) Number of beneficiaries of skills development training provided by the Project, disaggregated by gender (Number) Increased number of tourism related enterprises (e.g., souvenir and handcraft shops, family and guest houses, restaurants, museums, etc.). (Number)	12	Number of museums refurbished (Number)		3	Consultancy Firm				
undertaken by the project (Number) 15 Improved access roads to selected tourism attraction sites (Kilometers) 16 Number of houses restored (Number) 17 Number of street lighting posts and bulbs replaced (Number) 18 Number of Parks upgraded (Number) 19 Production and distribution of new maps based on geo-tourism database (Number) 20 Percentage of households in Project areas with home-based economic activities (Percentage) 10 Vumber of beneficiaries of skills development training provided by the Project, disaggregated by gender (Number) 10 Vumber of beneficiaries of skills development training provided by the Project, disaggregated by gender (Number) 10 Vumber of beneficiaries of skills development training provided by the Project, disaggregated by gender (Number) 10 Vumber of beneficiaries of skills development training provided by the Project, disaggregated by gender (Number) 11 Vumber of beneficiaries of skills development training provided by the Project, disaggregated by gender (Number) 12 Vumber of beneficiaries of skills development training provided by the Project, disaggregated by gender (Number) 13 Vumber of beneficiaries of skills development training provided by the Project, disaggregated by gender (Number) 14 Vumber of beneficiaries of skills development training provided by the Project, disaggregated by gender (Number) 15 Vumber of beneficiaries of skills development training provided by the Project, disaggregated by gender (Number) 16 Vumber of beneficiaries of skills development training provided by the Project, disaggregated by gender (Number) 18 Vumber of beneficiaries of skills development training provided by the Project, disaggregated by gender (Number) 18 Vumber of beneficiaries of skills development training provided by the Project, disaggregated by gender (Number)	13			8	Consultancy Firm				
Number of houses restored (Number) Number of street lighting posts and bulbs replaced (Number) Number of Parks upgraded (Number) Production and distribution of new maps based on geo-tourism database (Number) Percentage of households in Project areas with home-based economic activities (Percentage) Number of beneficiaries of skills development training provided by the Project, disaggregated by gender (Number) Increased number of tourism related enterprises (e.g., souvenir and handcraft shops, family and guest houses, restaurants, museums, etc.). (Number) O 58 Consultancy Firm Consultancy Firm 189 240 Consultancy Firm 29 240 Consultancy Firm Consultancy Firm Consultancy Firm Consultancy Firm Consultancy Firm Consultancy Firm	14		0	420	Consultancy Firm				
Number of street lighting posts and bulbs replaced (Number) Number of Parks upgraded (Number) Production and distribution of new maps based on geo-tourism database (Number) Percentage of households in Project areas with home-based economic activities (Percentage) Number of beneficiaries of skills development training provided by the Project, disaggregated by gender (Number) Increased number of tourism related enterprises (e.g., souvenir and handcraft shops, family and guest houses, restaurants, museums, etc.). (Number) O 760 Consultancy Firm Consultancy Firm 4 67 Consultancy Firm Consultancy Firm Consultancy Firm Consultancy Firm Consultancy Firm Consultancy Firm	15	Improved access roads to selected tourism attraction sites (Kilometers)	0	35	Consultancy Firm				
Number of Parks upgraded (Number) 19 Production and distribution of new maps based on geo-tourism database (Number) 20 Percentage of households in Project areas with home-based economic activities (Percentage) 21 Number of beneficiaries of skills development training provided by the Project, disaggregated by gender (Number) 22 Increased number of tourism related enterprises (e.g., souvenir and handcraft shops, family and guest houses, restaurants, museums, etc.). (Number) 23 Consultancy Firm 24 Consultancy Firm 25 Consultancy Firm 26 Consultancy Firm 27 Consultancy Firm 28 Consultancy Firm 29 Consultancy Firm 20 Consultancy Firm 20 Consultancy Firm 21 Number of tourism related enterprises (e.g., souvenir and handcraft shops, family and guest houses, restaurants, museums, etc.). (Number)	16	Number of houses restored (Number)	0	58	Consultancy Firm				
Percentage of households in Project areas with home-based economic activities (Percentage) 19 Production and distribution of new maps based on geo-tourism database (Number) 10 Percentage of households in Project areas with home-based economic activities (Percentage) 11 Number of beneficiaries of skills development training provided by the Project, disaggregated by gender (Number) 10 def Consultancy Firm 11 Increased number of tourism related enterprises (e.g., souvenir and handcraft shops, family and guest houses, restaurants, museums, etc.). (Number)	17	Number of street lighting posts and bulbs replaced (Number)	0	760	Consultancy Firm				
Percentage of households in Project areas with home-based economic activities (Percentage) 16,5 19,8 Consultancy Firm disaggregated by gender (Number) Increased number of tourism related enterprises (e.g., souvenir and handcraft shops, family and guest houses, restaurants, museums, etc.). (Number)	18	Number of Parks upgraded (Number)	0	4	Consultancy Firm				
(Percentage) Number of beneficiaries of skills development training provided by the Project, disaggregated by gender (Number) Increased number of tourism related enterprises (e.g., souvenir and handcraft shops, family and guest houses, restaurants, museums, etc.). (Number) 16,5 19,8 Consultancy Firm Consultancy Firm 189 240 Consultancy Firm	19	Production and distribution of new maps based on geo-tourism database (Number)	0	20 000	Consultancy Firm				
disaggregated by gender (Number) 10 467 Consultancy Firm 21 Increased number of tourism related enterprises (e.g., souvenir and handcraft shops, family and guest houses, restaurants, museums, etc.). (Number) 22 Consultancy Firm 23 Consultancy Firm 240 Consultancy Firm	20	·	16,5	19,8	Consultancy Firm				
shops, family and guest houses, restaurants, museums, etc.). (Number)	21		0	467	Consultancy Firm				
23 Increased hotel beds in circuit areas (Number) 10 939 15 277 Consultancy Firm	22		189	240	Consultancy Firm				
	23	Increased hotel beds in circuit areas (Number)	10 939	15 277	Consultancy Firm				